

Appendix B - Tender Evaluation Summary Matrix	
Title of Procurement:	Three Rivers District Council - Leisure Management & DBOM
Lot Number	Lot 1 - DBOM Contract & Leisure Management

Evaluation Team	Ray Figg, Dave Saunders, Kelly Barnard, Robin Thompson, Bond Dickinson, Nigel Pollard, James Baldwin, [REDACTED]
------------------------	--

Applicants	Selection	Award - Quality			Total Weighted Score	Ranking
	Executive Summary	Services / Technical Capacity	Technical / Cost	Commercial / Pricing Tables / The Contract		
	Complete	40	10	50		
Fusion Lifestyle	0	28.8	6.0	36.9	71.7	1
Sports and Leisure Management	0	30.2	6.8	24.6	61.5	2

The following scoring ranking should be used for services evaluation, technical evaluation and commercial evaluation (except legal).

Score	Rating	Criteria for Awarding Score
1	Unsatisfactory / Unacceptable	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution does not meet any of the Requirements
2	Poor	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution falls far short of meeting the Requirements
3	Very Weak	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution falls significantly short of meeting the Requirements
4	Weak	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution falls moderately short of meeting the Requirements
5	Acceptable	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution does appear to meet Requirements but some inference needed where not fully demonstrated or evidenced
6	Satisfactory	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution does satisfactorily meet Requirements and is supported by clear evidence
7	Good	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution does meet Requirements and will bring some added value / benefit
8	Very Good	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution exceeds Requirements and will bring added value / benefit
9	Outstanding	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution significantly exceeds Requirements and will bring significant added value/ benefit
10	Exceptional	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the Bidder's proposed solution significantly exceeds Requirements in all respects and will bring very significant added value / benefit

The following scoring ranking should be used for the legal evaluation

Score	Rating	Criteria for Assessing Score
1	Unacceptable/Unsatisfactory	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the submission is unacceptable or unsatisfactory. No comments or information provided or a rejection of fundamental principles, or mark-up and comments made demonstrate little or no appreciation of the issues and risks involved in the Project. The Bidder does not accept the broad principles in the draft Contract and any amendments to risk allocation do not demonstrate any benefit/savings to the Authority. Comments and information submitted are unsatisfactory or unclear in more than one key area.
3	Poor	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the submission has identifiable shortcomings. Mark-ups and comments made demonstrate a very basic appreciation of the issues and risks involved in the Project. The Bidder's approach does not accept the broad principles in the draft Contract and any amendments to risk allocation do not demonstrate any benefit/savings to the Authority. Comments and information submitted are unsatisfactory or unclear in more than one key area
5	Satisfactory	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the submission is satisfactory. Mark-ups and comments made demonstrate a basic appreciation of the issues and risks involved in the Project. The Bidder's approach indicates a broad acceptance of the principles in the draft Contract and any amendments to risk allocation demonstrate some limited benefit/savings to the Authority. Comments and information submitted are sufficiently detailed in key areas
7	Good	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the submission is good. Mark-ups and comments made demonstrate a good appreciation of the issues and risks involved in the Project. The Bidder's approach indicates acceptance of the principles in the draft Contract and any amendments to risk allocation demonstrate a number of benefits/savings to the Authority. Comments and information submitted demonstrate a good appreciation of the issues and risks involved and are designed to improve the delivery of the Project. Comments and information submitted are sufficiently detailed in key areas
10	Excellent	The Authority and its advisers are confident, in their professional judgement, that the submission is excellent. Mark-ups and comments made demonstrate an excellent appreciation of the issues and risks involved in the Project. The Bidder's approach indicates detailed acceptance of the principles in the draft Contract and any amendments to risk allocation clearly identify a number of benefits/savings to the Authority in a clear and credible fashion. Comments and information submitted demonstrate an excellent appreciation of the issues and risks involved and are demonstrably improve the delivery of the Project. Comments and information submitted are detailed in key areas

Applicant:	Fusion Lifestyle
Title of Procurement:	Three Rivers District Council - Leisure Management & DBOM
Procurement Reference:	Lot 1 - DBOM Contract & Leisure Management

Method Statement	Max Score (1-10)	Actual Score	% Sub Criteria	Weighted Score	Evaluators Comments
Executive Summary					
Executive Summary requirements	Complete		N/A	N/A	
Services / Technical Capacity					
The Outcomes	10	8	5.0	4.0	Gave an overview of the Council's strategies, objectives and outcomes. Then linked in how they can help meet them. Committed to working with the Council and key stakeholders. Looking to identify a new role for Three Rivers Community Sport Network (CSN). Carried out research on local socio-demographic factors on William Penn, The Centre and Rickmansworth Golf Course to formulate their proposals. Gave examples of increased participation at a number of their other contracts. Some good case studies including walking football to demonstrate how they will target the Council's target groups. They will look at a number of initiatives to drive increased participation including 'run regular, free of charge, open weekends to encourage people that would not normally participate to come and try out the facilities, or simply to have a look around with their friends or family. The open weekends will incorporate taster sessions and opportunities for local sports clubs to showcase their activities; 'we will continually use free day passes as a promotional tool'; work public health colleagues to build on the existing exercise referral and cardiac rehabilitation schemes to provide further health awareness programmes. They will link in with national sporting campaigns. They will honour the Motivate4 membership scheme in place currently until the new South Oxhey Leisure Centre opens, at which point, we will introduce our free-of-charge Rewards card (centre membership scheme). Looking to source locally for Food and Beverage. They are looking to appoint a dedicated full time Sports and Community Development Officer and Sports and Community Development Apprentice. Would like to have seen in detail of how they are going to link up with the Council's Leisure Development Team. They gave recent examples of capital schemes.
General Reporting	10	8	0.5	0.4	They have stated that 'Reporting against the Councils' Priority Outcomes will lie at the heart of our approach'. They will use their 'Outcomes Action Plans' and 'Balanced Scorecard methodology' to produce an Outcomes Scorecard for TRDC. Outlined meeting structure and conforms to specification. Contract Manager will be supported by Business Development Manager. Will provide monthly, quarterly and annual reports to Three Rivers District Council as outlined throughout the Services Specification and within the draft contract. Provided comprehensive information on how the reports can be used to demonstrate adherence to the performance standards and requirements set out in the Specification. Confirmed that they are fine with reporting to Leisure Committee on an annual basis with a draft structure.
Service Development Plan	10	7	5.0	3.5	They outlined a general approach to 'Sports and Community Development'. They will have a 'dedicated Sports and Community Development Officer, free from operational responsibilities, to focus purely on the creation and delivery of the Sports and Activity Development Plan with a focus on innovative, strategic and targeted activities'. Also, a 'dedicated Sports and Community Development Apprentice to support SCD activity and the delivery of the SAD Plan in Three Rivers'. Will link in with local, county and national key stakeholders. They have provided details of their service development policies and how the plan will be formulated, implemented and reviewed. They are clear and thorough including a clear understanding of the Council's strategies. Would have liked more information on how they will link closely with the Council's Leisure Development Team. They will bring in their 'Great Outdoors' brand to 'demonstrate the benefits of taking part in an activity outside and encouraging people to take part'.
Annual Marketing Plan	10	7	3.0	2.1	They gave their Corporate approach towards marketing and then split it down into the Three Rivers Contract. Comprehensive on their marketing proposals (including golf) on meeting the proposed participation levels utilising all available media mediums. Local, Corporate and National campaigns will be used to increase participation. Demonstrated how they will use social media. They stated that they will have a comprehensive marketing campaign for the launch of the extended and redeveloped The Centre (South Oxhey Leisure Centre), as well as the other refurbished facilities. They recognised the importance of Three Rivers District Council's branding and it 'would be used to stress the Authority's ownership of the facilities and continued role in overseeing them'.
Major Incident Reporting	10	7	0.5	0.4	Sound response on major incident reporting. They have produced a Serious Incident Management Pack (SIM Pack) 'to demonstrate the detailed planning that will be done at each of the centres to ensure that the teams are prepared should such a major incident occur'.
Participation Targets	10	7	3.0	2.1	They are 'confident' to continuously increase the participation of the Council's target groups and clearly state how they are going to do so, including increasing their group exercise programme, outdoor activity programme and introduction of a reward scheme. Their dedicated full-time SCD Officer and SCD Apprentice will primarily be responsible for driving up participation rates. They have confirmed that they are comfortable with the KPIs set out in the Council's draft Outcomes Scorecard. Will increase the following by end of contract year 4 - Children (under 11 years old) and young people (11-18 years old) - up by at least 30%; older people (60+ years old) - up by at least 20%; women and girls - up by at least 30%; people on low incomes and the unemployed - up by at least 30%; people with disabilities - up by at least 20%; people from ethnic minorities - up by at least 20%.

Innovation	10	8	3.0	2.4	They have outlined their general philosophy of continuous improvement and then outlined a number of 'innovations' including: Accredited Leadership and Management Development Programme, (the first of its kind in the leisure industry); Fusion 360 - inspection system is the primary route by which reactive maintenance tasks are identified; new products such as Intensity, the Great Outdoors, Go Express, Bickels Yard etc.; the bespoke design and delivery of an online booking system; and a cleaning audit system. Recently introduced a new Smartphone app for booking activities and notifying customers on waiting lists when a space becomes available. In terms of programming, 'will introduce more low-impact and chair-based group exercise classes to encourage participation by first-timers and older people' and 'introduce Walking Football, Walking Netball and Walking Basketball for older, or less mobile people'. Shortly introducing 'Vouga (a cross between yoga and the Vogue dance) and Aquaphysical (a step up from aqua yoga, using pool-based floats) into our group exercise programmes'. They offer 'the use of SWIMTAG in a variety of aqua exercise classes, as well as promoting members and customers to use SWIMTAG as part of their training regimes'. They will also have an 'Improved Concierge through a new point-of-sale system'. 'Looking at the development of a points and rewards system based on activity which links to Life Fitness cardio equipment to record activity'. They also intend to introduce jet skis in the pool proposal (battery powered inflatable jet skis for use by children in indoor pools). The refresh of the golf course will be incorporated into 'the annual grounds maintenance programmes of our chosen subcontractor'. Will incorporate a 'specialist swing studio' at Rickmansworth Golf Course.
Quest Accreditation	10	5	2.5	1.3	They have been engaged with Quest for over 10 years - presently 54 sites with 5 excellent. Their Integrated Management System (IMS), is accredited to ISO9001 (Quality Management), ISO14001 (Environmental Management) and OHSAS1801 standards (Health and Safety), houses all company policies, procedures and work instructions. They have committed to the following: Securing Quest 'Excellent' scores at both The Centre, and William Penn Leisure Centre at the second cycle of assessments after investment works are completed; further, we will commit to achieving Quest Stretch at the newly refurbished The Centre, and at William Penn at the third cycle of assessments; during the second cycle of our Quest assessments, Fusion commit to completing the swimming lessons module, which is formally the equivalent of 'Swim 21". Nothing about Rickmansworth Golf Course and if Fusion felt Quest wasn't appropriate, what other external quality standard/award will they bring in.
Customer Care	10	8	2.5	2.0	One of its core values and is integrated into the culture of organisation. It has 'created a bespoke customer feedback system called "Please Tell Us What You Think" (PTUWYT), which allows the customer to provide feedback and comments and enables us to manage complaints, compliments and suggestions received'. - very well laid out. A Monthly Mystery Visit Programme is in place, undertaken by a third party. It will use user forums, meet the manager sessions and non user surveys as well as the likes of user surveys and exit interviews. They have a comprehensive training programme for their staff and all attend a Disability and Equality Awareness Course in partnership with Interactive, a charity committed to creating disability equality in sport. They will use external mystery shopping as a means of assessing quality on at least a quarterly basis.
Pricing Requirements	10	6	1.0	0.6	They have confirmed that the proposed pricing meets the stipulated price restrictions set by the specification. Also, it will have a 'singular pricing point across all activities and memberships in each facility' and they have provided indicative pricing levels. They have stated that they are committed to honouring the protected programming requirements outlined in the specification. We also commit to honouring the prices set out in 'Authority Pricing Requirements' as maximum prices'. They have confirmed that they will continue to offer golf season tickets. 'We have also suggested a slightly higher price for non-centre members swimming at the pools. This is part of our approach to encourage all users of the centres to become members (free of charge as per our "Rewards" card proposals)'. This is not acceptable to the Council on two fronts - one casual users should not be penalised for not signing up to become members and secondly, the price for this does not conform to the specification. They have NOT reconsidered their pricing approach from ISDS. Fusion need to comply and a clarification question is needed. Response to clarification question is favourable and alternative pricing provided.
Opening Hours	10	7	1.0	0.7	Adhere to minimum opening hours. They will also increase the opening hours of the newly developed South Oxhey Centre to mirror those at William Penn.
Programming	10	8	3.0	2.4	Point out that as a fully registered charity, they want to engage all sections of the community and will link with them in a variety of ways including meet the manager sessions and local stakeholder engagement. Outlined how they will both expand programme and cater for target groups. They have included a section on expansion of golf programme at Rickmansworth Golf Course. They will also engage with NGB's and have outlined how they are presently working with the NGB for squash and badminton. Will analyse Sport England segmentation and latent demand. Intend to introduce new sessions and activities including MyRide. Will introduce 'Friday Night Project, which is a diversionary activity for 14-25 year olds, and will complement the current Mill End Youth Project, to be introduced at each of the leisure centres on Friday evening'. Also women only evenings/activities including coach tuition. Will undertake school holiday programming. An on line booking system will be in place. In addition to above, they will also have an 'outdoor programme' approach - activities such as boot camp which will take place in 'outdoor areas associated with our leisure facilities / nearby parks'.
Mobilisation and TUPE	10	6	1.0	0.6	The Indicative Mobilisation Plan and handover list was comprehensive and gave examples of recent mobilisations - 8 in past 4 years. Process of how it will engage/consult with current staff and have committed to a smooth transfer. On TUPE, they will follow a due diligence process. Fusion's intention 'is to ensure that existing members of the Local Government Pension Scheme are provided with the opportunity to enjoy continued membership'. Also, 'As regards other existing members of staff, we will ensure that they are offered pension arrangements which are at least as good as current schemes'.

Staffing	10	7	2.0	1.4	Named as the winners of 'Large Employer of the Year' - 2015 UK Active Awards. The Contracts Manager will also be General Manager at William Penn Leisure Centre and they will report into a Divisional Business Manager. Clear organisation structure and the Centre's structures. Narrative about the staffing structure of the Company and all the sites. Clear policies on training, recruitment and retention. They have an Academy which incorporates their own range of training courses which are accredited by the Chartered Institute of Environmental Health (CIEH). Also, committed to apprenticeships. They have a Leadership and Management Development Programme in place. There will be a Sports and Community Development Officer (and the Sport and Community Development Apprentice) and a Customer Relations Manager at both the new Centre and William Penn and will be part of the site management teams. Confirmed that they 'agree with the Council's assumption that TUPE will apply in this case and our proposals are based on all of the employees on the TUPE list, including existing job roles and staffing structures, transferring to Fusion upon contract commencement'. Have outlined their considerable experience of TUPE transfers. Following clarification response: Confirmed that there will be a full time technical officer dedicated to the Three Rivers Contract?
Health & Safety	10	7	2.0	1.4	It has a company Health and Safety Strategy with appropriate procedures, policies, systems and responsibilities. Health and Safety is a core part of their Integrated Management System (with OHSAS18001, ISO14001 and ISO9001) and this is clearly evidenced in the appendices provided. Their Health and Safety Manual and systems are externally certified against the British Standards Institute (BSI) accreditation to OHSAS 18001. They retain the services of Quality Leisure Management Services (QLM). Clear responsibilities right up to Board Level.
Security & CCTV	10	7	1.0	0.7	Split into sections from Management of Security to Management of Safeguarding Issues. It is thorough covering all the bases.
Equipment	10	7	1.0	0.7	They will further adapt the inventory schedule to reflect the specific requirements of the draft Services Specification and their 'financial submission includes allowance for the replacement of equipment throughout the contract term as appropriate'. They are proposing to introduce the following new equipment: Fitness Equipment primarily for the new The Centre, ICT - numerous including self-service kiosks and "Doorman" PC turnstile control, Catering equipment with an emphasis on the new The Centre, and an state of the art swing studio which will be introduced at Rickmansworth Golf Course 'utilising hi-frequency lighting, video analysis/ballflight analysis equipment, TV monitors and directional hitting microphones'. Outlines how it will maintain and monitor equipment.
Routine & Reactive Cleaning	10	8	1.0	0.8	Covered all the bases and a clear commitment to high quality of cleaning. Showed how they will go about it at both a routine and reactive level. They intend to use a specialist 'cleaning supplier to carry out daily, periodic but more importantly specialist cleaning services'. Clear policies and schedules in place. They will use their 'Fusion 360 software facilitates our twice daily inspections of our facilities'. A weekly check will be performed jointly by the external cleaning Contract Manager and Fusion's General Manager and any remedial actions undertaken. They will have 'mystery visitors' on at least a quarterly basis and the quality of cleaning will be fed back and acted on accordingly. They have outlined a number of ways customers can feedback including the Monthly 'Meet the Manager' sessions.
Environmental & Energy Management	10	7	1.0	0.7	They have ISO14001. Really good policies and plans. Commitment to Reduction in annual energy use. Increase in recycling rate and decrease in waste and shows ways of how they are going to achieve this via IMS. They outlined a Green Travel Plan for users and Staff and provided travel plan of one of their contracts. A commitment to improving performance with the following targets: 10% reduction in general refuse per year, Increase recycling rates to 50%, Reducing energy and water consumption by a minimum of 2% per year. They will have pool covers for the new The Centre.
Catering & Vending	10	7	1.0	0.7	They have own catering brand "Bickels Yard" and has been implemented in 20 of their venues. They intend to provide full café services at the South Oxhey Leisure Centre and William Penn Leisure Centre, with a vending offer. At Rickmansworth Golf Course they will increase confectionary and vending provision within the club shop area. They are presently looking to renegotiate the deal with the current concession at RGC. They are aware of the Council's requirements with regards to healthy options. Clearly branded from the lay out of the cafe to the menus, selection of food and beverages. Catering Management Structure and Roles in place for TRDC contract. They will ensure at least 50% of our suppliers are based locally.
Total	200	142	40	29	
Technical / Cost					
Development Opportunities	10	6	2.0	1.2	Circa £8.6 million investment - the two main elements being circa £8 million for The Centre and circa £500,000 for William Penn. Looking for refurbishment/extension of The Centre. Minimum specification requirements including 4 lane pool and learner pool. Additional, 2 story high climbing wall, 80 station fitness gym, spin studio. Opening up of the sports hall. William Penn: 'Customer journey improvements', including 'significant refreshment of the existing changing areas' and 4G pitch. At RGC, some capital works including 'reconfiguration and redecoration of the existing entrance and reception area so as to provide better and extended foyer space'. Works on The Centre, January 2019 to April 2020- why so long to commence? ; William Penn- Internal - Sep 2018 to Jan 2019, MUGA Spring 2019. Following clarification response: Confirmed that timescales for The Centre is 'conservative' - happy to explore ways the programme can be accelerated.
Design and Proposals	10	6	3.0	1.8	Simple drawings. Sound design for The Centre. Moving the fitness gym above part of learner swimming pool, all changing rooms on ground floor, creating spinning studio and more multi purpose rooms on first floor. Are the 'dry side' changing rooms large enough - What membership / casual usage is this catering for? One side of café looks onto the teaching pool. William Penn and Rickmansworth Golf Course (Fairway Inn) - sound design with narrative but no drawings for either site. Following clarification response: They have stated that the works at The Centre 'can be delivered without partial disruption to existing activities.....aim to minimise the impact of these partial closures by relocating activities as appropriate in unaffected areas'. Full consultation with Youth Centre to minimise impact. Confirmed that no significant disruption at William Penn during work programme.

Planning	10	6	2.0	1.2	The Centre - Comprehensive Risk Register. Basic project plan. Outlined Construction Costs. Fusion is proposing a direct contractual arrangement with the Council. Provided contact names and details of the key people within Fusion's bidding team. They have used Abbey Design Architectural Services, who they have worked with on several other projects for development proposals. Following clarification response: They outlined their approach, which would include completing a 'Community Impact Assessment to identify key risks and start to formulate appropriate mitigating actions'. Nothing specific on the works at William Penn. They pointed out their considerable experience in similar projects. In terms of steps, it includes 'to ensure the designs reflect the planning information supplied as part of ISDS documentation, and to fully consult with Planning department - they intend to employ an independent planning advisor.
Maintenance	10	6	3.0	1.8	Agree to the risk allocation matrix. 'Our approach is led centrally by our Head of Asset Management and Business Improvement, and his direct reports, our two Regional Facilities Managers, Group Health and Safety Manager, Energy and Environmental Manager and Compliance Manager. An allocated Divisional Facilities Manager will form a key part of the contract senior management team, working closely with the Contract Manager and all General Managers. Our dedicated local technical team will consist of the Divisional Facilities Manager who will line manage a divisional Technical Officer. We will also employ a full-time apprentice to join the maintenance team'. Draft PPM schedules produced for all sites including SJA. TABS FM is their software for asset and facility management. They will use an external company Kier for their M&E PPM services - long term partnership of 15 years. They have confirmed that within their 'financial projections incorporate a significant annual budget to reflect the anticipated costs of planned preventative maintenance, reactive maintenance and repairs activity and lifecycle maintenance'. This is based on their Leisure Management Contract experience. Sub Contractors will have 'an ISO14001 (or similar) certified management system and provide their environmental policy statement'. Nothing on grounds maintenance although not part of method statement requirement. Quality controls in place. They will produce and maintain a Maintenance Asset Register. They have a responsive and relative maintenance system in place. Following clarification response: Maintain in accordance to appendix 6 of specification (PQQ) and outlined their steps. Intend to meet the capital costs of Fairway Inn and RGC through the annual grounds maintenance budget and lifecycle maintenance budgets. For grounds maintenance of golf course, they will employ a specialist grounds maintenance supplier.
Total	40	24	10	6	
Commercial / Pricing Tables / The Contract					
General Deliverability	10	8	3.3	2.6	Overall provides detailed projections with key areas identified and rationale underpinning assumptions presented. No major concerns on the proposed projections and can demonstrate the deliverability
Operational Income	10	8	3.3	2.6	Income is second highest but the average income across the contract length is within 5% of other bidders so no major concerns in delivery - give examples of where delivered similar increase in income
Operational Expenditure	10	6	3.3	2.0	Expenditure is lowest of the four bidders - no major concerns over allowance for expenditure, although recognising the overall approach means there are some reservations about levels of expenditure
Affordability	10	9.0	20.0	18.0	Based on Affordability calculation - £443,051 per annum below affordability level
Agreement to the Terms of the Contract	10	5	5.0	2.5	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Robustness & Completeness of Legal	10	7	3.0	2.1	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Agreement to Performance Monitoring System	10	5	2.0	1.0	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Outline Business Case	10	8	4.0	3.2	Business case presented with good supporting documentation on the deliverability and the scale of return. The approach to refurbishment and redevelopment of the Centre delivers the best return for the Council
Build Costs and Fees	10	6	3.5	2.1	Present a breakdown of the build costs which are detailed. Some provisional sums identified- not clear on ground conditions solution
Delivery and Risk	10	3	2.5	0.8	There are still a number of key risks around future delivery of the capital. At this stage of the project there will need to be further development of the capital and particularly planning discussions to be had. Particular issues include Ground Condition Survey and Services
Total	100	65	50	37	

Applicant:	Sports and Leisure Management
Title of Procurement:	Three Rivers District Council - Leisure Management & DBOM
Procurement Reference:	Lot 1 - DBOM Contract & Leisure Management

Method Statement	Max Score (1-10)	Actual Score	% Sub Criteria	Weighted Score	Evaluators Comments
Executive Summary					
Executive Summary requirements	Complete		N/A	N/A	
Services / Technical Capacity					
The Outcomes	10	8	5.0	4.0	Gave an overview of how it is going to meet the Council's strategies, objectives and outcomes. Committed to working with the Council and key stakeholders. Has stated clear targets of meeting objectives set out in clause 1.5 of the Specification - Range from end of year 1 to end of year 5 of the Contract. Then go on to show how they are going to meet these targets, which includes annual development plans and pricing strategy. Provided examples of performance reports it would provide to the Authority. Carried out research on local socio-demographic factors of the District but nothing specifically Centre based. Gave examples of increased participation at a number of their other contracts. Also, a number of examples of good partnership working with Local Authorities including St Albans and Plymouth. Their Sport and Activity Development Plan will be geared towards the Council's target groups and they will appoint a dedicated Active Communities Manager. Everyone Active will become an active partner of the CSN and will establish a Project Liaison Group. Their procurement strategy will support the growth and sustainability of the local business economy and are committed to help the Council meet its environmental outcomes. They have given some examples around this. They aim to increase participation by 64% by year 5 of the Contract. Linkage with TRDC Leisure Development Team lacking. Variant Option: Soft play and climbing area within one half of sports hall at William Penn will increase participation in one of the Council's target groups, namely children and young people.
General Reporting	10	7	0.5	0.4	They will provide thorough monthly, quarterly and annual performance reports that cover a wide set of areas and KPI's using a balanced scorecard methodology and they outlined their approach for gaining base data and setting future targets. This is in order to meet the Council's strategic objectives. They provided a number of really good examples of reporting from other Contracts. Their Contract Manager will lead communication with the Council and they have outlined who will attend the monthly, quarterly and annual meetings. The Project Liaison Group consisting of both TRDC and SLM personnel will be involved in the consultation and development of the Annual Service Plan. The Everyone Active Management System (EQMS) and Gladstone MRM will be used for producing the majority of our reports and will be introduced to Three Rivers at the start of the contract.
Service Development Plan	10	7	5.0	3.5	Their Sports and Activity Development Plan 'aims to achieve greater usage in under-represented groups (young, elderly, disabled) and encourage individuals to take part in sports, health and physical activity'. The outcomes of the plan will be reported to the Project Liaison Group and other local partners (County Sports Partnership and Schools Partnerships) to ensure a joined up approach. They outlined a number of initiatives/case studies from other Contracts. The Active Communities Manager (with support of the South East Region's two Regional Partnership and Funding Managers) will lead on the implementation and reporting elements of the plan ensuring it reflects the Council's objectives. They outlined the activities that will contribute to the achievement of the above via an appendix- Activity and Golf Development Plan (2018-20). They are clear and thorough including linking in with Council's strategies, Sport England and Sporting National Government bodies, as well as outlining the current health state of the nation. Would have liked more information on how they will link closely with the Council's Leisure Development Team.
Annual Marketing Plan	10	7	3.0	2.1	They have produced an excellent draft Annual Marketing Plan as well as providing an overview of the media options available within Three Rivers. They have also developed a PR Strategy and Plan for the first year of the contract. They have confirmed that there will be a marketing plan for each of the sites. The Marketing Plan fully takes into account the Council's strategic objectives and they will use a number of ways to increase participation from target groups including active rewards and an active app. They have provided a Group Marketing team structure with listed external/agencies. They have allocated £62,000 to ensure a successful contract launch and have allocated resource for the new The Centre launch. They will use Sport England's Market Segmentation tool to help us understand more about Three Rivers population and their attitudes and characteristics, which in turn will link in with the marketing plan. They will implement a Single Customer View to bring together customer activity, engagement and feedback into one place.
Major Incident Reporting	10	7	0.5	0.4	Sound response on major incident reporting. It has OHSAS 18001 accreditation 'ensuring our commitment for improvement and compliance with standards'.
Participation Targets	10	8	3.0	2.4	Demonstrated how its branding and values links to national strategy of participating in 5 x 30 minutes of physical activity per week. 'We will strive to deliver an increase in participation and user satisfaction ratings for the facilities on an annual basis and recognise the Council's requirement to increase participation from specific target groups'. They have made forecasts for overall annual participation for each site by year 5 of the Contract, which shows substantial increase of usage. (Even RGC has an increase of 26%). They then split this down by key activity area. Then they proceeded to show how they would meet these targets and projections, although light on golf. They provided a couple of case studies which outlined how much they had increased usage and it was noted that this was in all areas of their business. Variant Bid: There will be an additional increase of 40,000 people.

Innovation	10	7	3.0	2.1	Managing innovation in our business is of major importance to SLM's approach to delivering high quality services to customers and clients'. They develop innovation through three areas, namely: leadership skills, organisational structure and reward strategies - they even provided an innovation wheel. They outlined their plans for the new The Centre and refurbishment plans for William Penn including upgrading the MUGA to 2x 5-a-side 3G pitches. Set out their 'market leader' approach to social media, fitness apps and web site. within their plans, showed lay outs and fitness equipment. They listed a number of 'innovative' programming development including aqua passport, Intensive model and Becky Adlington Swim Stars (BASS), virtual group exercise, fit for sport - legacy games, ICT, Single Customer View – Customer Feedback. Only light touch on Rickmansworth Golf Course.
Quest Accreditation	10	7	2.5	1.8	Although Quest is at the heart of our approach and the key management tool for quality assurance, we also strive to achieve other quality accreditations and awards through various assessments and systems; e.g. Investors in People, mystery shopping exercises, CIMSPA Pool Quality award, ISO 14001 (gained companywide in 2014), OHAS 18001, Inclusive Fitness Initiative, Sport England National Benchmarking Service and many more'. Their target is to be ranked in the upper quartile (top 25%) of all national facilities with a minimum score of 'Good'. They have confirmed that this score will be maintained or improved throughout the length of the contract. They proposed the following : 'William Penn Leisure Centre maintain 'Good' but we propose to gain Quest Excellent by Year 3. The Centre maintain 'Good'. Rickmansworth Golf Course maintain 'Good' but we will increase the ranking. South Oxhey Leisure Centre once open, we will achieve Quest 'Excellent' within 18 months'. Elsewhere, they have achieved 'Excellent' within 17 of their centres. They have provided examples and case studies from other Contracts of how they have improved Quest ratings.
Customer Care	10	8	2.5	2.0	A comprehensive response. 'SLM believe that delivering quality customer care is key to the success of the facilities we run'. They went through their charter, vision, customer care standards, comprehensive staff training schedule, customer feedback, customer forums, mystery shopper, social media. Their 'customer feedback flowchart' in particular was very good. Confirmed that they would meet the Council's timescales when dealing with complaints. They will use surveys including non user surveys, forums and steering groups to measure if they are meeting the expectations of our customers. They will use external mystery shopping as a means of assessing quality on a monthly basis. Provided details of 'single customer' view. They have committed to improving the customer feedback rating of all sites within 18 months of commencement of Contract.
Pricing Requirements	10	8	1.0	0.8	They gave an overview of 'analysis of local needs'. Recognised that there are pockets of deprivation within the District and gave examples of this. In order to increase usage from these areas, will bring in a number of initiatives including free guest passes. They outlined their approach to pricing with competitor analysis and competitor price analysis. Not looking to put up prices over and above CPI with the exception of golf and as a 'result of the investment at South Oxhey we are confident we can bring pricing for William Penn and South Oxhey in-line with one another'. They have confirmed that they will offer at least a 20% discount on core prices for relevant activities to specific targets groups identified in Appendix 3 of the Specification. They outlined added benefits including free public swimming in the holiday periods to people on the swimming scheme.
Opening Hours	10	8	1.0	0.8	Will open over and above minimum opening hours. This is mainly at week-ends and for The Centre (SJA) and William Penn. They have provided schedules to support this. They also intend to open for more hours on Bank Holidays, Christmas Eve, Boxing day and New Years Eve.
Programming	10	8	3.0	2.4	Our activity programming brand, Everyone Active, has been developed based on our understanding of the need to increase participation in physical activity at all levels..... promotes and encourages communities to participate in 5 x 30 minutes of physical activity every week. Programme categories include fitness, health & wellbeing, aquatics, children's activities, golf sports development (including golf) and events'. Programming and Booking Systems clearly laid out. Outline comprehensive programming for Council's key target groups, linking it back to the Sports and Activity Participation Plan. Examples, developing the golf development programme, referral scheme, and disability swimming lessons. They also outline a range of other programming initiatives around swimming pool, health and fitness, gym activities for 11-15, group exercise and golf. Several examples of linking with partners including English Federation of Disabled Sport and Amateur Swimming Association. Confirmed that they will honour all protected bookings. Recently been awarded UK Active operator of the year. Variant Option: Bring in clip and climb walls at William Penn. Following clarification response, they outlined that they would move football bookings presently in the sports hall to the new 3 G external pitches.
Mobilisation and TUPE	10	8	1.0	0.8	Considerable experience in mobilising contracts as demonstrated within their narrative and appendices. They confirmed that they will carry out the transfer of colleagues in line with the TUPE Regulations 1706 and outlined their approach in four stages. They have confirmed that 'everyone will have their own workplace pension' and go onto documenting this. The Indicative Mobilisation Plan and handover list was comprehensive as was the narrative behind it. Clear process of how it will engage/consult with the Authority, current staff and users of the facilities. They are committed to a smooth transfer.
Staffing	10	8	2.0	1.6	Excellent lay out. Outlined its achievements, namely Investors in People Accreditation, numerous Quest Accreditations and number of external awards such as UKactive FLAME Operator of the Year (five years out of the last seven and most recently in 2016), and ASA Facility Operator of the Year. Outlined its support and senior management structure as well as providing structure chart - comprehensive. The Regional Contract Manager will be the Contract Manager who will report into a Regional Director. There will be a Contract Maintenance Manager and Active Communities Manager who will both be based at William Penn. Clear staffing structures in one of the appendices pre and post The Centre development. Clear policies on training recruitment and retention. They have a Management Development Programme in place and provided case studies of staff being promoted from within. They also have a NVQ and Apprenticeship Programme in place across the organisation and it will be brought to Three Rivers. From their staff survey of 2014, 76.20% of colleagues are highly satisfied or satisfied with their job within SLM. Following clarification response: Confirmed that the the Contract Manager to be based from either William Penn or The Centre from the beginning of the contract and retain the responsibility of that site.

	10	7	2.0	1.4	It has a company Health and Safety Policy with comprehensive procedures, practices, systems and responsibilities. Their Health and Safety Manual and systems are externally certified against accreditation to OHSAS 18001. All sites will be audited by 'an external company (one site per year; e.g. British Assessment Bureau, Quest, UKactive, IQL and / or our partners at RD Health and Safety Ltd) to determine their compliance with legislation'. Demonstrated clear responsibilities right up to SLM Board Health and Safety Committee. From a support perspective 'particular responsibilities and duties will be overseen by the field based South East Region HS&Q Manager' who reports into the Group HS&Q Manager.
Health & Safety					
Security & CCTV	10	7	1.0	0.7	Split into sections and it covers all the bases comprehensively. There will be a security plan for each site.
Equipment	10	8	1.0	0.8	They have budgeted for the likes of replacement furniture, vending units and larger items of plant equipment. Have priced up equipment for the new The Centre of circa £390,000 and the break down is shown within one of their appendices. They will agree and sign off the Council's equipment inventories provided in Appendix 5 of the Specification within one month of the service commencement date and update it on an annual basis. They are proposing to introduce the following new equipment, with the main items being: Fitness Equipment (in first two years and then at set points within contract); Group Exercise - This includes equipment to enable them to deliver Les Mills (both Virtual and Traditional) classes; Swimming equipment; Catering equipment and furniture for The New Centre, William Penn and Fairway Inn (Circa £60,000). ICT spend for all three sites. Outlines how it will maintain, monitor and replace equipment. New defibrillator will be purchased for all the sites and William Penn will also receive one for the 3G pitch. Variant Option: Clip and climb and soft play equipment for William Penn of circa £210,000 and new service counter of circa £23,000.
Routine & Reactive Cleaning	10	8	1.0	0.8	Covered all the bases and a clear commitment to high quality of cleaning. Showed how they will go about it at both a routine and reactive level. Gave examples of national recognition. Clear policies and schedules in place and recognise the importance of having the right equipment and management 'buy in'. Routine cleaning will be undertaken 'in house' via an 'operations assistant' at SJA, The Centre and William Penn. Deep cleaning will be undertaken by external specialists. There is a section on keeping grounds clean and tidy and a section on Managing cleaning during building / reconstruction activity, primarily around The Centre development. They will also have 'Inspection Tours of facilities' four times per day. A very thorough and tidy response.
Environmental & Energy Management	10	7	1.0	0.7	Whilst energy conservation is the principle aspect of our environmental management services, our activities are also directed towards water conservation, waste minimisation and management, procurement, green travel, refrigerants, chemical usage and spillage, pollutants and biodiversity'. Gave case studies from a number of their contracts. They have ISO14001. Really good policies and plans. Commitment to Reduction in annual energy use, Increase in recycling rate and decrease in waste and shows ways of how they are going to achieve this via site specific Environment Management Plans. They outlined a Green Travel Plan for users and Staff - 'In addition to 'green' promotional activity, the GTC's will engage with their Council counterparts to link the centres with the Authority's Travel Plan and other related initiatives in the region'. They will purchase Pool covers. With respect to the new The Centre: 'Our construction partner has incorporated energy efficiency into their design considerations (to attain BREEAM 'Good' as a target requirement) so those areas being constructed or significantly redeveloped will be fitted with modern, efficient and energy saving plant and equipment'. Their company standard targets include a commitment to a 5% reduction per year in CO2 emissions from operational leisure centres and a 100% target of zero waste sent to landfill.
Catering & Vending	10	8	1.0	0.8	Clear lay out. Presently manages 53 catering facilities. 'Our approach has led to SLM gaining a high quality reputation for providing a balanced and environmentally sustainable, healthy range of products that offer customers value for money and improves satisfaction levels'. They then throughout this section go into more detail of what this is including appealing to the Council's target groups - very comprehensive and appetising. They will develop the 'grab and go' concept. They intend to find another third party operator for the Fairway Inn. For this venue, they have 'budgeted £60k to replace equipment items and will provide the facilities with a deep clean and refurbishment. They have allocated £75k to renovate the kitchen, function area and flat - this will include new paintwork, flooring and carpets'. Clearly branded from lay out of the cafe to the menus, selection of food and beverages. SLM will work with the Council to promote Fair-trade and Rain Forest Alliance Products. 'We will ensure the offering in our vending machines are at least 50% healthy'. They 'will achieve a Food Hygiene 'Scores on the Doors' 5 star rating at both William Penn Leisure Centre (current rating of 4.5) and South Oxhey Leisure Centre'. Free Wi-Fi within cafes and centres. Comprehensive food and hygiene procedures and practices. Variant Option: Additional seating and a server area for the café will be introduced at William Penn if the climb and soft play area comes to fruition.
Total	200	151	40	30	
Technical / Cost					
Development Opportunities	10	7	2.0	1.4	£8.1 million for The Centre: £150,000 for internal works and £100,000 for MUGA at William Penn Well structured layout although it would have been good to have an overview of works proposed. The Centre - Looking to start in April 2018 and to be completed in July 2019. Looking for refurbishment/extension of The Centre. Minimum specification requirements including 4 lane pool and learner pool. Additional, Enlarged Fitness Suite with new male and female dry change areas within the new extension. Two larger studios are provided by moving one into the new extension. Change of Reception entrance and lay out. William Penn - spinning studio and 4G MUGA.
Design and Proposals	10	7	3.0	2.1	Sound design for The Centre and good positioning of changing rooms on first floor. One side of café looking onto the learner pool. William Penn - sound and straightforward design and proposal. Following clarification response: Confirmed that allocated funds for refurbishing the function and kitchen areas at Fairway Inn. Also allocated £160,000 in first three years for repairs, maintenance and lifecycle replacement of site. Outlined impact of services when works taking place and confirmed that the Youth services will continue throughout the works.

Planning	10	6	2.0	1.2	Basic risk register. Section of their approach to TRDC planning department. 'Our schemes have been designed by HCD Architects and costed by our construction partners Vincent Stokes whom in turn will engage YBS Ltd, to undertake the required M&E and HVAC aspects of the project We have also engaged project management and cost analysis specialists (Paragon) to ensure that the quotes we have received are best value and in line with industry standards'. The Centre: Bid document with drawings (also shown separately), risk register, cash flow, cost plan. William Penn: Indicative costs and lay out of site. Following clarification response: Went through their consultation strategy with local residents. In terms of planning application for The Centre, they went through their process and would like to meet Planning to present their plan for The Centre and gauge their feedback.
Maintenance	10	7	3.0	2.1	They have created draft Asset Management Plans for each of the facilities detailing breakdown of costs for the 20 year contract term. These consist of schedules with costings for redecoration, lifecycle, PPM and general repairs for each of the sites including SJA. Also a draft PPM schedule - comprehensive. 'Our budget allocations are designed to meet requirements defined in the specification and risk matrix'. Is this enough - do they need to actually state that they are 'accepting the requirements of the Specification in relation to section 1.16 (Maintenance) AND the allocation of maintenance responsibilities as set out in Appendix 6'? Costings/schedules include ground maintenance. Intend to retain services of golf course maintenance contractor. The management team will use CAFM "Property Database", WAM (Workflow Asset Management) for delivering PPM, Reactive Maintenance and Lifecycle Replacement. Clear maintenance resource management structure in place with the Contract Maintenance Manager reporting into the Contract Manager and General Manager's. Maintenance activity within TRDC will be overseen by the SLM South East Region Technical Manager. They have included a section on external maintenance. Provided details of their partners in the major re-development works at South Oxhey and refurbishment at William Penn. Confirm who will undertake the M&E work on the sites? They have a responsive and reactive maintenance system in place. Following clarification response: Confirmed that we use the company in-situ for Grounds Maintenance at RGC and confirmed that will be maintained as part of the Grounds Maintenance Agreement. Confirmed that allocated funds for refurbishing the function and kitchen areas at Fairway Inn. Also allocated £160,000 in first three years for repairs, maintenance and lifecycle replacement of site. Confirmed its acceptance to meeting section 1.16 and responsibilities set out in appendix 6. Confirmed that Yorkshire Building Services will carry out M&E works at the sites.
Total	40	27	10	7	
Commercial / Pricing Tables / The Contract					
General Deliverability	10	8	3.3	2.6	Overall provides detailed projections with key areas identified and rationale underpinning assumptions presented. No major concerns on the proposed projections and can demonstrate the deliverability
Operational Income	10	8	3.3	2.6	Income is lowest but the average income across the contract length is within 10% of other bidders so no major concerns in delivery - gave examples of where they delivered similar increase in income.
Operational Expenditure	10	8	3.3	2.6	No major concerns over allowance for expenditure, comparable with other bidders and all major items identified
Affordability	10	1.1	20.0	2.2	Based on Affordability calculation - £5,576 per annum below affordability level
Agreement to the Terms of the Contract	10	7	5.0	3.5	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Robustness & Completeness of Legal	10	7	3.0	2.1	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Agreement to Performance Monitoring System	10	5	2.0	1.0	See Appendix B - legal evaluation
Outline Business Case	10	7	4.0	2.8	Business case presented with good supporting documentation on the deliverability and the scale of return. The approach to refurbishment and redevelopment of the Centre delivers a good return for the Council.
Build Costs and Fees	10	8	3.5	2.8	Present a breakdown of the build costs which are detailed. Some provisional sums identified
Delivery and Risk	10	9	2.5	2.3	There are still a number of key risks around future delivery of the capital. At this stage of the project there will need to be further development of the capital and particularly planning discussions to be had. Ground conditions and services have been resolved
Total	100	68	50	25	